Systematic Review of Literature on Workforce Diversity in Pakistan

[1]*Rana Nadir Idrees, [2]*Abdus Sattar Abbasi and [2]*Muhammad Waqas

[1]COMSATS Institute of Information Technology, Sahiwal, Pakistan
[2]Department of Management Sciences, COMSATS Institute of Information Technology,
Lahore, Pakistan

Abstract: The purpose of the research is to study literature on different work force diversity dimensions of Pakistan. The objective of this conceptual analysis is to discuss methodology, findings and identify limitations in research work under review and point towards unresolved issues, if any that can pave the way for further research in the field of work force diversity management in Pakistan. Workforce of Pakistan is not delivering effectively, which, among other factors, may be attributed to lack of desired level of diversity in terms of age, culture and gender. Corporations are experiencing problems due to the absence or in-adequate application of diversity management policies while maintaining relationship with different stakeholders (including colleagues, customers, suppliers etc). Establishing a clear differentiation between the public and private sector organizations in Pakistan is also an area lacking due research coverage in the past. Research gap is evident from the fact that not a single study has been conducted to analyze and compile a critical review of workforce diversity literature in Pakistan. Why work force diversity management is not effectively applicable in all types of organizations in Pakistan? Why gender diversity in work force is not given due consideration to improve organizational effectiveness? This is a qualitative study involving review of previous literature on work force diversity in Pakistan. For this purpose, relevant rules, laws, ordinances, notifications, reports and scholarly research papers have been analysed to better understand and assess the need for a diversified work force. The data has been accessed from authentic sources and indicated accordingly. The conclusions have been drawn using deduction method. In private organizations, female employees are discriminated more than the male employees as compared to public sector organizations. Heterogeneity in workgroup is a key deriver in making more innovative and effective decision. Owners and managers with sound educational background and commitment work for diversity.

Key words: Workforce diversity · Gender diversity · Culture · Pakistan · Performance · Public sector · Management

INTRODUCTION

Understanding the importance of and developing a diverse work force is a key thing for hiring and retaining the best talent and achieving the desired performance level. This in-fact enhances the problem solving skills and creativity of the organizations. Equal employment opportunity policy requires hiring and retaining workforce without discriminating on grounds of their race, color, religion, gender etc. and upholding merit [1].Workforce diversity is a wider concept and includes all similarities and difference among workers.

More diversity in management was necessary if the needs of employees, having diverse socio-cultural, ethnic, religious background, age, gender and marital and parental status, were to be met [2]. The word diversity is firstly perceived as giving employment to minorities and affirmative action. But it is not confined to this aspect only. Review of available literature on work force diversity in Pakistan points towards so many other factors that also need to be considered in this domain. The majority of researchers have stated one point categorically that diversity is not a new concept.

Corresponding Author: Rana Nadir Idrees, COMSATS Institute of Information Technology, Sahiwal, Pakistan.

April and Shockley two researchers explained in 2007 similar belief when they stated that diversity issues are not new [3]. It has been observed that some of the employees are generally not ready to believe on dynamic state of their work environment. This research signifies the workforce diversity in private and public sector enterprises together with professional level diversity management. Also explains its degree of relevance for private or public sector organizations [4]. It is also discussed that the cost of handing diversity is directly proportional to level of diversity achieved/to be achieved in workforce.

Work force diversity in terms of culture, globalisation, multi-generation is fuelling the on-going change in work place across the world and Pakistan is not an exception. Diversified workforce has triggered differences based on age, culture, disabilities, race, religion and gender in the public and private sector organisations of Pakistan. Globalisation leads to diversified workforce in practice which in-turn creates divergence among employees in terms of thinking patterns, norms, values and religions. Women in Pakistan are now actively contributing towards the success of business organizations with their presence in almost in all the sectors. Apart from some other factors, squeezing income levels, increasing family size and price hike coupled with economic recession have led this change to happen. Multi-generations also lead to workforce diversity. One can observe a higher mix of young and aged people in workplace. They usually have conflicting aims, ideals, requirements and experiences which at times lead to problems at workplace requiring effective management. Workforce is diverse owing to the existence of different cultures in the four provinces of Pakistan. The workforce becomes more diverse when the element of expats is added to the work place. Culture affects attitude of the people, therefore, when people from different cultural backgrounds become part of a single workforce, they demonstrate different values and behaviours. In such a scenario, irrespective of the fact that they work in a public, private or non-for-profit organization, workforce diversity management becomes one of the top agenda for managers. Key emphasis of managers currently is to handle the diversification of workforce and safeguard the interest of employees without any discrimination.

It is stated that all those organizations who attach high value to manage diversity are more successful and forward looking [5]. Diversity handling is significant both in private and public sector set ups. The roots of this implied significance can be traced in the constitutional articles and provisions of different countries including Pakistan which discourage discrimination and inequality on any account.

The Objective of Study: The purpose of the research is to study literature on different work force diversity dimensions of Pakistan.

The objective of this conceptual analysis is to discuss methodology, findings and identify limitations in research work under review and point towards unresolved issues, if any that can pave the way for further research in the field of work force diversity management in Pakistan.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

The present blend is dependent on an extensive review of available literature gathered from different databases. This is a qualitative study which analyse relevant rules, laws, ordinances, notifications, reports and scholarly research papers. The study was kicked off through initiation of desk research to identify and collect relevant data/literature. Original themes were refined as more and more literature was reviewed.

The researcher reviewed all the available literature, by surfing scholarly Google in particular and Google in general.. Based on analysis of data gathered during desk research, existing structure of workforce diversity management in the civil and private structure of Pakistan was understood. The study is compiled to present analyses the methodology, findings and gaps identified during the literature review process and make recommendations for scope of future research in this area. Both induction and deduction methods were used to understand and draw conclusions.

The following table indicates three phases adopted to sort out material of particular relevance:

Firstly, the work for analysing and selecting content was complex because some articles and reports make only passing reference to the study design and approaches for getting data. For researches that blend the effort of others, there is possibility of facing additional problem of not specific justification for and procedure undertaken to decide on the material to be studied. It is unfeasible to force any selection approach with regard to technique during the early periods of searching as in many of the researches, information of this kind was not present, or was given in a vague, incomplete or distinctive mode.

Secondly, in view of the literature classified in Phase 1 and 2, a number of themes were extracted. The research papers and reports identified comprise one or more of the

Table 1: Phases of Review

	Phase 1	Phase 2	Phase 3
Description	First examination of literature of no relevance	Examine attentively the research papers, reports etc. where the relevance was lesscertain	Ascertaining and reviewing literature which seems to be of appropriate relevance.
No. of findsRemaining	109	43	32

Table 2: Focus of 32 studies

Focus of the study	No. of studies	References
Managing cultural diversity in the organizations of Pakistan	7	(Bashir, Jianqiao, Abrar, & Ghazanfar, 2012); (Baig & Sattar, 2001); (Learned); (Qureshi & Raja);(Shamim & Abbasi, 2012); (Hussain & Yousaf, 2011);(Abdullah, Boyle, & Joham, 2010);
Comparison of work force diversity in public and private sector	5	(Abbasi); (Channar, Abbassi, & Ujan, 2011); (Channar, Soomro, and Parkashlal, 2011); (Zaidi, Saif, & Zaheer, 2010); (Afzal, Mahmood, Samreen, Asim, & Sajid, 2013)
Religion and work force diversity management in Pakistan	1	(Zafar, 2011)
Marital /parental status and work force	3	(Malik & Khalid, 2008); (Ahmad & Hafeez, 2007); (R. E. A. Khan & Khan, 2009)
Challenges of global workforce	2	(Howell, Lewer, Altman, & Akdere, 2008);(AbuzarWajidi & Chandio)
Gender and work force diversity management in Pakistan	13	(Swamy, 2003); (Faisal, 2010); (Shaheen, Sial, & Awan, 2011); (Kahloon); (Iqbal, Afzal, & Inayat); (Mirza & Jabeen); (Arifeen, 2011); (Arifeen, 2008); (Salman); (Abbas, Hameed, & Waheed, 2010); (Lee & Saeed, 2001);(S. Khan & Khan); (de Figueiredo & Branchi, 2009)
Pakistan Model of diversity	1	(Syed, 2008)

elements such as: gender diversity, racial diversity, multi generational diversity, diversity based on sexual orientation, diversity linked to foreign public and private sector organizations. Other elements included material relevant to human resource management issues other than workforce diversity within Pakistan. Some of the elements were workforce studies in South Asian countries with regard to HDI and poverty indexes.

The Literature Survey: The scholarly articles, reports and rules & laws reviewed have been grouped into seven broad categories based on their mandate, framework and findings. A total of 32 qualitative and quantitative studies were identified as relevant to the subject of work force diversity in Pakistan. Any categorization of the main emphasis of these researchers is ready for disagreement, but a functional classification into seven kinds is given in Table 2. A few of these researches could have been positioned into more than one class and their insertion is planned to meet the requirements of this review instead of their centre of attention.

Review Of Literature On Workforce Diversity In Pakistan: In this study, we have reviewed the literature on work force diversity in Pakistan. This literature can be divided into following types of studies.

Cultural Diversity: Most studies in Pakistan have concentrated on survey data and examined the concept of workforce diversity and the dimension of culture. For example, one of the study found that the perception of cultural orientation changes according to the grades, gender status and rank. They reached this conclusion analysing primary research data collected from 674 academic faculty members who were serving in 23 public sector universities. Grading structure and ranking coupled with gender type play a pivotal role with respect to setting of cultural orientations in higher education sector in particular and other sectors in general in Pakistan [6]. The role of civil society was examined, using primary research where a questionnaire was prepared to measure views regarding civil society organisations. The study found that civil society organizations are also not very successful in promoting gender equality within their own ranks as well as the in workplace and the society at large. The civil society might participate effectively in inculcating the culture of diversity at various levels, for example in promoting diversity culture at work place [7]. It was found, using Emotional quotient (EQ) staff survey involving a panel study on the topic highlighting issues associated with management of expat employees operating in Pakistan as well as foreign boss in Pakistan, that western workplace do not face fundamental fear and offers equality without any discrimination on grounds of

origin/nationality or class or age or gender. But here in Pakistani organizations, employees not only openly criticise the policies but also they have to face discrimination on the basis of class, age, gender and feudal relations [8]. Based on analysis of survey of 200 employees, concluded that the level of motivation between Pakistani and American woman shows no major difference [9]. Through empirical examination of different ethnic groups working as business mangers mostly in private sector, it was found that significant disagreement exists with respect to culture orientation among management representatives from different ethnicities of large scale private businesses of Pakistan [10]. It has been analysed that private sector organizations have congenial working environment for handling diversity among their work force for efficient delivery of goods and services. They used information collected from a sample of 200 private organizations[11]. It is concluded that HR practices can help to achieve long-term competitive advantage for the organization only when they are aligned with historical, social and political differences of a country. It was also found that, Pakistan culture is strong in uncertainty avoidance as compared to India. For this observation they used data collected through research on cultures by Hofstede in the year 1980 and 1993 [12].

Comparison Of Work Force Diversity In Public And Private Sector: Abbasi, using data collected from primary research method coupled with the secondary method mainly from two oil sector companies working within Pakistan, analysed the use of diversity management practices and policies. The study found that employees love to work where mangers are just and unbiased while dealing their subordinates. The study also found that PSO and Shell are willing and taking steps to give harassment free environment on the basis of different workforce dimensions [13].

Researchers also pointed out that female employee are facing more discrimination than their counterparts, in private organizations as compared to public sector. They came to this argument based on results of structured survey of more than 500 male and female employees working at various levels (both in public and private sector) in few districts of Sindh province. It was also discussed that this type of discrimination negatively effects satisfaction and motivation of employees and positively affects the level of stress among the staff. In both public and private sector organizations, the impact

of education profile of both genders is almost the same when it comes to the issue of gender discrimination. Moreover, female employees were perceived to be victim of discrimination more than the male employees in both the sectors [14, 15]. In other study researchers, using a survey questionnaire where data was collected from employees of banks operating in private sector of Pakistan concluded that workgroup heterogeneity plays a pivotal role in making better and innovative decisions. Hence, the businesses should go for inclusiveness, pluralism and diversity for quality decision making in the organizations [16]. Afzal, Mahmood, Samreen, Asim and Sajid in their study, used target population comprising of banking sector, health and medical services sector by taking a sample of 150 employees. They found that there is a big difference among workers of both public and private sector on account of conception and application of workforce diversity. The study also found that middle and operational levels of workforce are more diverse than top levels of workforce. Mostly diversity is found in gender than age and then comes ethnicity [17].

Religion And Work Force Diversity Management In Pakistan: It was found, using a case study method where a questionnaire consisting of 23 questions ranging from religiosity and spirituality was distributed between the Pakistan Army and the University Teachers, that the Pakistan Army and the University Teachers experience spirituality and religiosity more or less to a certain extent. Diversity Programs might be used to enhance workplace spirituality [18].

Marital /Parental Status And Work Force Diversity Management: It was found that due to increasing work force diversity and the changing work life demands for devising appropriate and quick mechanisms of work hour adjustments. For this they used information collected from interview method as a key research method. Eighty interviews were conducted in 17 banks operating in twin cities of Islamabad and Rawalpindi [19]. It was also concluded by researchers, by drawing data from the field survey of the district Mandi Bahauddin, conducted in the year 2002, that financial constraints and education level are the key determinants for deciding the women's labour force participation [20]. Another researcher contributed to the role of married women , using primary data and found that married women most likely become the part of labour force on account of poverty [21].

Challenges Of Global Workforce: To study global workforce with reference to Pakistan , the researchers found that keeping in mind the Pakistani workforce, individuals from different races, caste and culture should be aware of values, norms and believes of other co-workers to create an environment of co-existence with better understanding and working relationship [22].

Gender And Work Force Diversity Management In Pakistan: One of the study investigated labor force participation of women, using a qualitative research. It was found that male patterns of labor force participation are similar across countries, whereas those of females differ significantly. It was also found that one may expect that their participation in employment schemes will also be variable [23]. Another study found that a number of factors like women from urban background, married women, highly qualified, having large family size, are considered to decide joining labour force participation, using multiple Indicator cluster survey 2007-08 data of Punjab. It was also found that depending upon occupational status (such as employee, employer or self employed) females earn more than their counterparts [24].

Another researcher, using information from administering PWEI through face-to-face interviews with 300 women belonging to administrative, health and education sectors, concluded that only hiring more women at work place will not generate positive impact in getting congenial environment for the female employees [25].

It was concluded that females are given not only few opportunities to work on important projects but also sometime ignored of their contribution in performance appraisal. For this conclusion, data collected through questionnaire from employees of different age group and gender working at managerial positions from various sectors was used. It was also found that employees on gender basis are dealt with in different ways which resultantly cause havoc and impact productivity of organizations. In addition to the above, perception regarding female staff in the lead role is negative, subsequently creating stress among them [26].

One more study discussed the role of stereotypes that are effecting negatively to the perception of people on females in management, using both primary and secondary research tools and determined various reasons for this within the banking sector. It was also found that society has evolved a lot as compared to last few decades. It is changing with time. Currently one can see

a large parentage of women including married women in working class. At present, Single unattached females are also working with the mind to continue even after getting married, which one could not easily imagine at the outset of current century. Now organizations have to act effectively while managing employees at work place to give them better work environment [27].

Using self-reported experience reports, case studies and empirical studies, revealed that both public and private sectors are not implementing the laws ensuring equal employment opportunities. The role of the government and NGOs in unearthing the gender based discrimination is dissatisfactory. Further needed support to ensure access to justice for effected female workers is also lacking. It was also stated that government should direct and monitor all types of organizations in making and presenting annual reports with respect to their human resource development [28].

Researchers, using the survey research conducted in 152 organizations in three main cities, found that stereotypes correlate with female at managerial position. Moreover, Pakistani female manager are also not perceived to compromise their family commitments as in the western world. It was also revealed that English medium background matters a lot in getting management position within the existing set up. These considerations are important to handle the diversity at the work place both in the public and private sector. Work life balance policies may be implemented as well as measures to change the perceptions of the people be initiated to prevent gender discrimination [29, 30].

It was found that harassment at work place not necessarily of sexual nature is a key issue to be dealt in the organizations, using in depth interviews and surveys. It was also argued that drastic change is occurring in the proportion of female labour force as managers. Furthermore, the shift is mainly in schools, colleges and universities [31]. One more study, using data collected from 200 telecom managers of Pakistani industry for comprehending the impact of discrimination on the performance of employees, found that to protect the goodwill of the companies locally and globally, strategic and tactical level management should not practice gender based discrimination in recruitment and selection, promotion and facilities to the employees [32].

It is concluded that there is sharpest gender differences in all forms of earnings in Afghanistan and Pakistan [33].By doing literature review on oppression, oppressed group behavior and nurses and women in

Table 3: Articles and Provisions about work force diversity

Articles	Key Points
Article 25	All people are equal in the eyes of law and to make ensure that no gender discrimination will made.
Article 27	All citizens should not be discriminated in hiring at public sector organizations on the basis of race, religious believes, caste, gender.
Article 38	It says that welfare of the people should be ensured without discriminating on the basis of sex, caste, creed or race, by bringing equity in the rights of both the employer and employee.

Pakistan, it was found that Nurses in Pakistan are facing following forms of oppression ;(1) Discrimination, (2) Exploitation, (3) Marginalization, (4) Powerlessness and (5) Violence [34]. Using quantitative and qualitative data from 60 females working in textile factories in Karachi, it was discovered that the most of the female and male workers of the factories are hired on contract basis so they are not eligible for benefits like pension, gratuity, maternity leave, day-care, insurance and medical [35].

Pakistani Model Of Diversity Management: Using data from the speeches and ideology of Muhammad Ali Jinnah, the Founder of Pakistan, found that for handling diversity and creating equal chances for employment, following four key dimensions of Jinnah's vision are essential (1) democratisation,(2) an egalitarian version of Islam, (3) the implementation of a strict rule of law with no room for favouritism and discrimination and (4) special protective measures for minorities, women and other disadvantaged groups and a social case of diversity management [36].

Rules And Laws Regarding Workforce Diversity: Important articles and provisions related to managing workforce diversity are given in Table 4 [37].

Government has also worked on labour law reform and Employment and Service Conditions Act that talk about equal pay for work of equal value. Quota has been fixed for women in the public sector jobs (10%) and they can also compete on the remaining 90% seats. In 2010, a new law for protection of women against harassment at the workplace was made. The law says that both public and private institutions should make policies and programs to provide decent work environment for the female staff. The law also requires imposing fine, part of which will be given to the victimised women, coupled with the dismissal of the person committing harassment.

Diversity And National Assembly Of Pakistan: According to the survey conducted by PILDAT, it is almost impossible for an average person to be the member of the assembly. Women as representative in the making of the national assembly has received highest score of 65 % in the first three years of the precious assembly and in the end of last year score was 59% which mean a fall of

9% score. It is worth noting that representation of women in both assemblies (National and Provincial) was increased in the year 2002 which is more than the average (15%) of the world assemblies. In the last (13th) National Assembly women representation was 23% of the Assembly.

Work Force Diversity In SME's Of Pakistan: Another important study investigated through survey, revealed that owners and managers in SME's with good educational background and high level of motivation promote diverse culture within their organizations. Presence of female staff and minority staff in the organizations is an indication of having well diverse human resource and relevant policies. But the age factor of the entrepreneur and number of family members employed do not impact organizational diversity [38].

Work Force Diversity In Pakistan And International Reports: According to [39] , overall Pakistan is among the lowest-ranked diverse countries of the world including gender diversity and female economic activity in emerging economies where Pakistan score is 22%. These are mainly due to the religious and cultural norms of the country. As far as sectoral diversity is concerned, Pakistan falls in bottom five. In the nutshell, the least diverse workforces are in Poland, Pakistan, Hungary, Turkey and the Czech Republic. The position of Norway is on the top in the world-wide ranking of employee diversity.

Main findings of all the studies cited above are also summarised in Table 4.

Age Composition of Population: According to [40], with respect to size of the labour force, Pakistan stood at 10th number with 55.8 million people in the world after Bangladesh that is at 8th rank as given in the table below:

TFR (2009), using Table 6, found that labour force as male (41.91 millions) and female (11.81million) are 53.72 million.

Table 7 is showing population by age group in Pakistan. According to the table total male and female (in thousands) count is 155,772 and projected to reach at 246,272 in the years 2005 to 2030 respectively.

Table 4: Literature review of Workforce diversity in Pakistan

Authors	Data Sources	Key Findings	Research gaps
Bashir, Jianqiao, Abrar and Ghazanfar (2012)	It is primary research conducted in 23 public sector universities.	It was found that the perception of cultural dimensions orientation changes according to the grades, ranks, status and the gender type.	Private sector universities should also be studied for comparative study. Further corporate sector should also be included to get good results.
Baig and Sattar (2001)	It is also a primary research about the civil society organisations.	Civil Society Organization (CSO) is also not able to play its role in promoting gender equity in workplace and the society.	106 respondents might not be considered to be truly representative of the Pakistani civil society.
Learned (2007)	EQ staff survey was conducted.	Western workplace includes equality; no preference to foreigners, or based on class or age, Male-female equality. While work place here includes gender inequity, class & age barriers.	Panel discussions were conducted. There is a need to triangulate the research strategies coupled with increasing the sample size so that desired results can be achieved.
Qureshi and Raja (2013)	Primary data includes questionnaire.	The level of motivation between Pakistani and American female also shows no significant difference.	There is a need to triangulate the research.
Shamim and Abbasi (2012)	It is a survey based empirical study on managers from different ethnicity.	Significant disagreement exists with respect to culture orientation among management representatives from different ethnicities.	Culture orientation of Sindhi business managers is lacking. Next study can include the entrepreneurs.
Hussain and Yousaf (2011)	It is a primary research conducted in 200 private organizations.	Private sector organizations have congenial working environment including the policies and procedures for handling diversity among their work force.	There is a need to triangulate the research.
Abdullah, Boyle and Joham (2010)	Data collected through the research work of Hofstede?s in year 1980 and 1993.	HR practices including diversity management should be aligned with historical, social and political differences of a country Pakistan culture is strong on uncertainty avoidance dimension of culture as compared to India.	Long term orientation dimension (Hofstede, 1984) of culture is needed to be studied in Pakistan.
Abbasi ()	It is mainly a primary research conducted in oil sector of Pakistan.	Employees love to work where managers are just in their dealing with the workers. PSO and Shell are providing harassment free environment etc.	Other sectors should also be included to study the diversity management mechanism.
Channar, Abbassi and Ujan (2011); Channar, Soomro and Parkashlal (2011)	A survey based research was conducted.	In private organizations, female employees are discriminated more than the male employees as compared to public sector organizations.	Employees of public and private health and education departments from other districts should be included to make this study generalised.
Zaidi, Saif and Zaheer (2010);	A survey based empirical study of employees of private banks of Pakistan.	Heterogeneity in workgroup is a key deriver in making more innovative and effective decision.	Other dimensions of work- force heterogeneity are also need to be studied.
Afzal, Mahmood, Samreen, Asim and Sajid (2013);	It is also a primary research.	Middle and operational levels of workforce are more diverse than top levels of workforce. Mostly diversity is found in gender than age and then comes ethnicity.	Sectors other than banking sector, health and medical services should also be studied by taking more representative sample.
Zafar (2011)	Qualitative research strategy of case study method was used.	Diversity Programs can help to improve the level of spirituality at workplace between Army and the University Teachers of Pakistan.	Quantitative method can be used to substantiate the results. Other sectors should also be researched to make the study more general
Malik and Khalid (2008)	Qualitative research strategy method of interviewing was used as a key study tool.	Devising appropriate mechanisms for work Hour Adjustments is required due to the diversified workforce and work life demands.	Probability sampling technique should be used and banks in cities other than twin cities of Islamabad and Rawalpindi should be included.
Ahmad and Hafeez (2007)	Field survey was done.	The education level and financial constraints are the key determinants for women's labour force participation decision.	It needs to be more generalised. It is a sort of case studies. Other areas for example problems faced by female workers from their peers, supervisors and other stakeholders.
R. E. A. Khan and Khan (2009)	It is a primary research.	Poverty causes married women to become the part of labour force.	The cluster sample technique has been used. There is need to triangulate the research.
Howell, Lewer, Altman and Akdere (2008)	It is a qualitative cum quantitative research.	Individuals need to understand one another's diverse races and cultures for better working.	More quantitative research methods should be utilised, more scientific approach can be followed.
Lee and Saeed (2001)	It is a qualitative research.	Nurses in Pakistan are facing following forms of oppression ; (1) Discrimination, (2) Exploitation, (3) Marginalization, (4) Powerlessness and (5) violence.	Data should be collected through the survey based research technique.
S. Khan and Khan ()	It is a qualitative and quantitative research.	Most of the factories workers are from low socio-economic background and hired on contractual basis.	There is a need to follow probability sampling technique and more factories across the country should be included for doing study.
Swamy (2003)	It is a qualitative research.	Male patterns of labor force participation are similar across countries, whereas those of females differ significantly.	Some important issues to be researched include impact of information on Women's participation and Effect of community involvement or intermediation in selection of projects and workers on women's participation.
Shaheen, Sial and Survey Awan (2011)	Multiple Indicator Cluster 2007-08 data of Punjab.	Decision to participate in the labour force is strong if female is from urban background, married, having quality education and having more family members. Females earn more than males in some occupational status.	More recent survey is required to be done in all the provinces of Pakistan.
Faisal (2010)	Administered PWEI through	Merely having more female working face-to-face interviews. staff does not mean enhancing the working environment for them.	More representative sample is required. Sectors other than administrative, health and education should be included in the next study.

Table 4: Continue

Authors	Data Sources	Key Findings	Research gaps
Kahloon (2011)	Self administered questionnaire was used in most of the cases. Respondents were both young and middle aged people.	Discrimination is done in giving important projects to the female staff. Their contribution is not reasonably acknowledged. They are not positively perceived as leaders.	Researcher needs to go to other cities for collecting data on self administered basis in order to reduce biases and ambiguities.
Iqbal, Afzal and Inayat (2012)	It is a qualitative research.	Both public and private sector organizations are not implementing the legislation ensuring equal employment opportunities to both sex types.	Quantitative research methods should be utilized to overcome publication bias.
Mirza and Jabeen (2011)	It is a quantitative and qualitative research conducted in the banks of Pakistan.	More female staff particularly the married female is now actively participating in the work force as compared to last decade.	Sample size consists of only 150 respondents that should be large to avoid lack of generalizability and variability. Data should be collected through triangulation.
Arifeen (2008, 2011)	The mail survey was conducted.	There is a greater trend among multinationals to hire women in Pakistan similar to other parts of the western world. Culturally speaking, Punjabis and Urdu-speaking ethnic groups are less conservative than others.	Sample used is too small. Secondly, public sector organizations and those organizations where women could be owner/managers were excluded.
Salman ()	It is a primary research and information collected through in depth interviews and surveys	Harassment has been acknowledged as a prime factor at work place. Female labour force participation at managerial level is increasing primarily in educational sector.	Data should be collected through triangulation. Sample should be more representative.
Abbas, Hameed, & Waheed (2010)	It is a quantitative research conducted in telecom sector from supervisors.	One of the factors determining the goodwill of the companies is now the will of the strategic level management not to allow discriminatory policies and programs in recruitment and selection, in promoting to next grades and other benefits including fringe benefits to the employees.	This study needs to be triangulated as far as data collection is concerned.
De Figueiredo & Branchi (2009)	It is a qualitative research.	On the basis of all kinds of earnings, the gender difference is the sharpest between Afghanistan and Pakistan.	Quantitative research methods of data collection should be used. Other countries of the region should be included as well.
Syed (2008)	It is a qualitative research.	Model for diversity management should follow the four directions mainly includes (1) democratisation, (2) an egalitarian version of Islam, (3) the rule of law without any nepotism and discrimination and (4) steps to safeguard the rights of minorities and women.	To consider the society specific context by taking into account the financial together with social implications for managing diversified workforce is important.
Choudhary (2011)	It is a qualitative research.	Owners and managers with sound educational background and commitment work for diversity.	Problem is with the inadequate representative sample.

Table 5: Size of Labour Force in the world

Size Of Labour Force		Labour Force
Rank	Country	(Million)
1	CHINA	812.7
2	INDIA	46.7
8	BANGLADESH	72.5
10	PAKISTAN	55.8
33	NEPAL	18
56	SRI LANKS	8.1

Source: Ministry of Finance, Government of Pakistan

Table 6: Labour Force (In millions)

	2007-2008	2008-2009
Total	51.78	53.72
Male	40.82	41.91
Female	10.96	11.81

Source: Ministry of finance, government of Pakistan

Table 7: Population by Age groups in Pakistan Projection (000s)

AGE GROUP	2005	2010	2015	2020	2025	2030
TOTAL M+F	155,772	173,383	192,262	211,397	229,337	246,272
MALES						
0-4	9,562	11,886	12,429	12,711	12,350	12,062
5-9	10,047	9,287	11,631	12,205	12,513	12,180
10-14	10,130	9,936	9,210	11,554	12,133	12,446
15-19	9,897	10,047	9,878	9,161	11,503	12,084
20-24	7,885	9,767	9,958	9,801	9,089	11,428
25-29	6,240	7,729	9,655	9,859	9,706	9,001
30-34	5,077	6,099	7,627	9,555	9,763	9,617
35-39	4,460	4,957	6,008	7,536	9,459	9,673
40-44	4,042	4,349	4,869	5,919	7,440	9,354
45-49	3,465	3,926	4,249	4,770	5,812	7,320
50-54	2,796	3,331	3,795	4,120	4,637	5,664
55-59	2,035	2,633	3,155	3,609	3,932	4,440
60-64	1,543	1,854	2,416	2,911	3,346	3,662
65-69	1,199	1,341	1,625	2,133	2,587	2,992
70-74	841	973	1,100	1,346	1,782	2,179
75+	921	1,077	1,271	1,482	1,796	2,315
TOTAL	80,140	89,190	98,874	108,670	117,849	126,417

Source: Ministry of finance, Government of Pakistan

Table 8: Employed labour force by sector (%)

	2007-2008			2008-2009		
Sector	Total	Male	Female	Total	Male	Female
Agriculture	44.6	36.9	75	45.1	37.3	74.0
Manufacturing	13.0	13.3	11.8	13.0	13.3	11.9
construction	6.3	7.8	0.4	6.6	8.3	0.4
Transport	5.5	6.8	0.2	5.2	6.6	0.2
Services	13.7	14.4	10.6	13.66	11.1	11.6
Others	2.3	2.9	0.2	0.10	2.9	0.3
Total	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00

Source: Ministry of finance, Government of Pakistan

Table 9: Employed- Pakistan and Provinces (million)

	Employed					
	2007-2008			2008-2009		
Area/Province	Total	Male	Female	Total	Male	Female
Pakistan	49.09	39.06	10.03	50.79	40.04	10.75
Rural	34.48	25.79	8.69	35.54	26.46	9.09
Urban	14.61	13.27	1.34	15.25	13.59	1.66
Punjab	28.97	22.07	6.9	29.95	22.68	7.27
Sindh	12.26	10.43	1.83	12.72	10.67	2.05
Khyber Pakthoonkhua	5.73	4.65	1.08	5.97	4.77	1.2
Balochistan	2.13	1.91	0.22	2.15	1.92	0.23

Source: Ministry of finance, Government of Pakistan

Key Indicators For Employment Trends And Changes:
According to TFR (2009), Table 8 is depicting that proportionately most of the female labour force is engaged in agriculture, manufacturing and services sectors respectively. Male labour force is engaged in every sector when comparing to female staff.

Table 9 is showing employed labour force by Provinces of Pakistan. According to the labour force survey data, total labour force in Punjab, Sindh, Khyber Pukhtoonkhua and Balochistan is 7.27 million, 2.05 million, 1.2 million and 23 million respectively.

CONCLUSION

The researcher through this study has made an effort to bridge the research gap and bring together a synopsis of literature available on workforce diversity in Pakistan including variety of dimensions such as cultural diversity, sector wise comparison of work force diversity in public and private sector along with SME's sector, religious diversity, marital /parental status diversity, challenges of global workforce, ethnicity issue in workforce, gender diversity, the typical model of diversity management in Pakistan, rules and laws regarding workforce diversity in Pakistan and diversity issues in the national assembly of Pakistan.

The key driver to handle the workforce is to comprehend their diversity and socio-cultural orientation. Unfortunately, training mechanism and counselling is either lacking or ineffective for helping out employees to understand and respect the differences particularly the cross cultural and cross gender comprehensions for building sound relationship.

All the studies seem to share that workforce diversity is very pivotal for the organizations (irrespective of their domain i.e. public or private or industry). Although there have been some goods signs of improvement in workforce diversity indicators in Pakistan, however, there is still a lot to be done to be competitive in the comity of nations.

REFERENCES

1. Hansen, F., 2003. Diversitys business case doesn't add up. Workforce, 82(4): 28-32.
2. Jayne, M.E. and R.L. Dipboye, 2004. Leveraging diversity to improve business performance: Research findings and recommendations for organizations. Human Resource Management, 43(4): 409-424.
3. April, K. and M.L. Shockley, 2007. Diversity: New Realities in a Changing World, Palgrave Macmillan.
4. Aronson, D., 2002. Managing the diversity revolution: Best practices for 21st Century Business. CRJ, 6: 46.
5. Jain, H.C. and A. Verma, 1996. Managing workforce diversity for competitiveness The Canadian experience. International Journal of Manpower, 17(4/5): 14-29.
6. Bashir, M., *et al.*, 2012. The organization's cultural values: A study of public sector universities in Pakistan. African Journal of Business Management, 6(10): 3686-3693.
7. Baig, A.S.R. and A. Sattar, 2001. Civil Society in Pakistan. CIVICUS Index on Civil Society Occasional Paper Series, 1(11).
8. Learned, M.L. Pakistan Earthquake Review.
9. Qureshi, U.Q. and N.T.S. Raja, A Comparative Study of Cultural Dimensions and Motivation Level of Pakistani and American Female Managers.
10. Shamim, S. and A. Abbasi, 2012. Interethnic Culture Orientation of Business Managers in Pakistan. Middle-East Journal of Scientific Research, 12(5): 632-642.
11. Hussain, T. and I. Yousaf, 2011 Organization culture and employee satisfaction: A study in private sector of Pakistan. Journal Of Quality And Technology Management. II(Vii): 15-36.
12. Abdullah, A., S. Boyle and C. Joham, 2010. Role of Cultural Factors in Shaping Human Resource Management Practices in the Multinational Corporations (MNCs) Operating in the Emerging Markets of South Asia. Retrieved August, 21: 2011.
13. Abbasi, Z., Role of Discipline in the Organizational Maturity: An Analysis of Pakistani Business.
14. Channar, Z.A., Z. Abbassi and I.A. Ujan, 2011. Gender Discrimination in Workforce and its Impact on the Employees. Pak. J. Commer. Soc. Sci., 5(1): 177-191.
15. Channar, S. and Parkashlal, 2011. Impact of Education on Gender Discrimination A Comparative Study of Public and Private Organizations of Pakistan Australian Journal of Basic and Applied Sciences, 5(11): 2265-2271.
16. Zaidi, S.M.A., M.I. Saif and A. Zaheer, 2010. The effect of workgroup heterogeneity on decision making: an empirical investigation. Afr. J. Bus. Manage., 4(10): 2132-2139.
17. Afzal, F., *et al*., 2013. Comparison of Workforce Diversity in Public and Private Business Organizations. European Journal of Business and Management, 5(5): 109-113.
18. Zafar, J., 2011. Measuring religiosity and workplace spirituality in Pakistan: a case study of armed forces and university teachers. Cross-Cultural Communication, 6(4): 104-111.
19. Malik, A. and G.K. Khalid, 2008. Work/Life Conflicts and Desired Work Hour Adjustments: Banking Perspective in Pakistan. International Review of Business Research Papers, 4(5): 267-276.

20. Ahmad, E. and A. Hafeez, Labour supply and earning functions of educated married women: a case study of northern Punjab. The Pakistan Development Review, pp: 45-62.

21. Khan, R.E.A. and T. Khan, 2009. Labor Force Participation of Married Women in Punjab (Pakistan). Journal of Economic and Social Research, 11(2): 77-106.

22. Howell, E.S., *et al.*, 2008. AEPP 2008 CONFERENCE PROGRAM. The Association on Employment Practices and Principles (AEPP), p: 13.

23. Swamy, G., 2003. Gender dimensions of public employment schemes. Gender and Development Group, PREM, Washington DC: World Bank.

24. Shaheen, S., M.H. Sial and M.S. Awan, 2011. Journal of Social and Development Sciences. Journal of Social and Development Sciences, 2(3): 104-110.

25. Faisal, F., 2010. Measuring Perceptions of Work Environment among Educated Female Public Servants in Pakistan. Pakistan Economic and Social Review, 48(1): 135-165.

26. Kahloon, R.M., Gender Biasness: A Corporate or a Social Concern.

27. Mirza, A.M.B. and N. Jabeen, Gender Stereotypes and Women in Management The Case of Banking Sector of Pakistan. South Asian Studies, 26: 2.

28. Iqbal, H., S. Afzal and M. Inayat, Gender Discrimination: Implications for Pakistan Security.

29. Arifeen, S.R., 2008. A biographical portrait of private sector professional managerial women in Pakistan. Oxford Business and Economics Conference, June.

30. Arifeen, S.R., 2011. The Socio-demographic Progression Of The Pakistani Woman Manager 1988 To 2004 An Empirical Evidence From The Private Sector. Inside, 6(2): 34.

31. Salman, A., Skills Gap in Labour Market A Gender Perspective.

32. Abbas, Q., A. Hameed and A. Waheed, 2010. Gender Discrimination & Its Effect on Employee Performance/Productivity.

33. De Figueiredo, N.M.S. and B.A. Branchi, 2009. Evolution of Poverty and Income Distribution Among Brazilian Agricultural Workers and Families: An Analysis by Gender Between 1992 and 2007: Paper Presented at the FAO-IFAD-ILO Workshop on Gaps, Trends and Current Research in Gender Dimensions of Agricultural and Rural Employment: Differentiated Pathways Out of Poverty, Rome, 31 March-2 April 2009: FAO-IFAD-ILO.

34. Lee, M.B. and I. Saeed, 2001. Oppression and horizontal violence: The case of nurses in Pakistan. in Nursing Forum. Wiley Online Library.

35. Khan, S. and F. Khan, Public/Private Sector Policies Pertaining to Female Employment in Textile Sector of Pakistan. A Case study of Karachi textile factories.

36. Syed, J., 2008. Pakistani model of diversity management: rediscovering Jinnah's vision. International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy, 28(3/4): 100-113.

37. Feldman, H., 1955. A Constitution for Pakistan: [Karachi]: Oxford University Press.

38. Choudhary, A.I.A., 2011. Syed Azeem; Asif, Muhammad; Khattak, Arif, WorkForce Diversity in SME's Of Pakistan. [Academic Journal]. Interdisciplinary Journal of Contemporary Research in Business, 3(2): 1744.

39. Insights, F., 2012. Diversity & inclusion: unlocking global Potential.

40. TFR, T.F.R. 2009. Population, Labour Force and Employment. Economic Survey, pp: 10.